#### MAPPING ONLINE HATE SPEECH A selection of cases collected using the eMORE Webapp Belgium Northern-Ireland Germany e**MORE** R SS Italy Slovenia Romania Race Religion IN FOCUS Anti-Gypsyism Lgbt Xenofobia ৾৾ৠ Gender 5 Disability Cyprus Malta Project Co-funded by the RIGHTS, EQUALITY AND CITIZENSHIP PROGRAMME (2014-2020) of the European Union



#### Northern-Ireland

RACE, XENOPHOBIA, ANTI-MIGRANTS

**Northern Ireland** reported one case of xenophobia and anti-migrants hate. The screenshot does not refer directly to hateful language, but rather to the symbolism of hate. In fact, the picture shows a demonstration, where the National Front is showing its flag, on which is written: "We must secure the existence of our people and a future for white children". Further analysing the website of the North West National Front, it's easy to understand the xenophobic narrative used by the movement. On their website, they list a number of issues they are fighting for, including: 'British jobs for British workers; Time to leave the corrupt EU; Stop Immigration start repatriation; Stop racist attacks to white etc.'<sup>1</sup>.



<sup>1</sup> http://www.britishnationalfront.net/whatwestandfor.html







#### Northern-Ireland RELIGION

This case study followed the terrorist attacks of 2017 in Manchester. The post on Facebook only says 'No words needed', as the picture is self-explanatory. The message conveyed by the author of the post is that Europe, with its policies most probably related to the management of migration at different levels, on one side is fuelling the growth of Islam within its own borders. This is intended as a negative thing per se, as by doing that, in fact, Europe is auto-condemning itself, and this is represented through the slip-knot around 'her neck'. Not surprisingly, Europe is represented as a 'white male'.









**Germany** LGBT. HATE AGAINST WOMEN

The term *kampflesbe* is often used to insult lesbian women, whose appearance seems to be masculine. The author of the article herewith reported, in synthesis, is writing about the sexist advertising ban – images of women in lingerie are not allowed for example - in Berlin. Thereby he directly insults the mayor of Berlin, Monika Hermann, by addressing her with the word *kampflesbe*, because of her masculine appearance.

The offensive term *kampflesbe* is used also in some comments to the article, as in the examples reported in the screenshot.

In the first comment there is a verbal attack against feminists, and again, against the mayor of Berlin who is addressed as a lesbian; the author of the comment in this case refers both to gay women and feminists in an offensive and distorted way: "[...] Death to feminism ... Who wants a human society, must destroy this highly toxic feminism. This left green 'kampflesben' is just another vivid proof of this necessity".

In the second comment, the main argument is that insisting on banning nudes of both females and males in advertising would encourage 'mass immigrant Muslims' to continue with rapes, as well as that calling such advertising 'sexist' would be hypocritical and limit the portraits of women. Nazis in Reizwäsche: Genderpolizei am Gendarmenmarkt!



Bezirksbürgermeisterin Monika Herrmann hat "sexistischer" Werbung klar den Kampf angesagt (PI-NEWS berichtete hier und hier) und zeigt harte Kante gegen menschenverachtende BHs, Slips, Bikinis und Feinripp-Shirts. Bereits vor geraumer Zeit hat der von den Grünen regierte Berliner Bezirk Friedrichshain-Kreuzberg Werbeplakate "mit Frauen in reizender Pose und Dessous" auf den eigenen Werbestandorten verboten. Monika Herrmann ist nicht mit dem bayerischen CSU-Spitzenkandidaten Joachim Herrmann ("Roberto Blanco war immer ein wunderbarer Neger") verwandt oder verschnigert. Sie ist offensiv bekennende Kampflesbe, vas nicht unschwer zu erraten ist.



Bezirkshürgermeisterin Monika Herrmann (Grüne).









**Germany** DISABILITY

EINVERNOERUNG V KEINEINALITÄT V ISLAN V LINKE V ALTINEDEN V AKTIVISMUS V Q Verstehe ich nicht, wenn Europa so wunderbar zusammengewachsen ist, müssen wir doch nicht daran glauben. Das wäre dann eine Tatsache. Denn wir müssen ja auch nicht daran glauben, daß wir Luft zum Atmen brauchen. In Wahrheit will unser Pausenciown auf etwas anderes hinaus, nämlich auf die von oben anbefohlene Vermischung der Ethnien und auf die gar nicht mal schleichende und offiziell gutgeheißene Landnahme durch das Fremde. Als gelungenes Produkt dieser Weltanschauung bringt er sodann ein kurioses und arg unglückliches Beispiel – sich selbst. Er zum Beispiel, sagt er sehr, sehr lustig sein wollend, wäre in Wahrheit gar kein "gestandener" Bayer, weil seine Mutter ja Österreicherin sei. Echt jetzt? Wo ist da der himmelschreiende Unterschied? Und durften sich Bayer und Österreicher vor der Gründung der EU nicht paaren? Nee, Stefan, das war ziemlich schwach. Ich hätte dir dein gutmenschliches Statement abgekauft, wenn du gesagt hättest, daß dein Vater ein Buschneger sei, der jodeln kann.

Aber kleine Sünden bestraft Gott sofort. Inmitten seines amateurhaften Vielfalt-Gelabers schleicht sich von der Seite ein erwachsener Mongoloider ins Bild und stellt sich frech neben dem Vortragskünstler. Es ist so ein Parade-Mongo mit ständig raushängender Zunge und so. Das macht sich natürlich optisch nicht so doll, wenn der Durchrassungsexperte gerade das große Wort schwingt. Sofort schwenkt die Kamera weg und zoomt Stefan näher, um den Eindringling außer Bild zu schaffen. Aber so ein Mongo ist ja nicht doof und durchschaut den Trick instinktiv. Er schmeißt sich an Stefan ran, umklammert und umarmt ihn lachend. Schöne Scheißel Aber, das muß man schon sagen, ein schönes Bild der Menschlichkeit. This case analysed for Germany is the only one directly addressing people with disability. The hateful word is 'mong', which is derived from 'mongolosismus' (EN: mongolism) and is used as an insult to people suffering from the Down Syndrome.

The article published on the same right-wing website mentioned in case <sup>(1)</sup>, is a sort of an ironical post about a TV show called 'Immer wieder Sonntags' (a show about German pop music). In one section of the article the author describes the appearance in the show of an individual suffering from Down Syndrome by referring to him as 'Parade-Mongol', which means 'prime example for Mongolism'.

While there is no instigation to violence nor a direct attack on the person, the use of such hateful and unrespectful wording seems a way to offend the dignity of people with disability, based on no specific motivation rather than the offense against the 'diversity' itself (most probably based on a sense of 'superiority' for those who consider themselves as 'normal').

E





Belgium RELIGION



The author wrote a long, hateful and conspiracy-inspired post on migrants and Muslims, in which he affirms that Europe has been targeted by migrants and Muslims, who are slowly taking over thanks also to the support of political and religious leaders. In the section reported through the eMORE app (and documented with the screenshot) the author speaks about a "programmed invasion ... it could be the beginning of a disappearing process started via the submersion of the millenary European populations and civilizations, who take part to the European governments' projects of genocide against their own people"

From the post, it is possible to notice how the author is trying to use logic and history to support his theory, although he adapts data and twists words. When reading the rest of the piece, it is possible to notice a strong religious background and interest, although very superficial and often undeveloped, locked at a first, literal interpretation of the scriptures. The author tries to give more importance to his personal point of view and bias, by identifying Islam with the antichrist and by explaining modern episodes related to migration by recounting history, and therefore trying to achieve a credibility he does not have.



PREVIOUS CASE





The following case <sup>(1)</sup> collected in Belgium concerns a post on the videogames website jeuxvideo.com. It was posted on 18th of May 2012 and it was signaled to the eMORE App on 6th of July 2017. The page with the comment is no longer available, while the website is still functioning.

The post has clear homophobic content and talks negatively about gay men who look particularly groomed or not stereotypically masculine enough. The post implies that they are not manly enough, by putting the word men in inverted commas, and by saying that these people cannot integrate or be considered normal if they adopt a feminine style. That is also visible by the fact that men who adopt a more groomed style or appearance are directly called "faggots" and not men. There is also, once more, the use of the "us versus them" rhetoric, which underlines the division, the distinction, between the author and gay people. The author thinks that gay men do not have the right to complain about integration if they do not conform to the roles and definitions previously defined by society. There is a palpable anger against the inversion of gender roles and in the adoption of behavior or manners that do not belong to what is usually seen as "masculine".







The case described is related to the word 'retarded', which was found on an online forum among those selected by the Maltese partner when providing instructions to the Crawler. The link detected by the Crawler, dated 30 December 2017, contained a specific episode of hate speech concerning people of colour, combined with hate speech against persons with disability as the author of the post refers to black skinned people as "retarded". The author of the post comments on violence and vandalizing committed by people of African origin in Melbourne (Australia), in December 2017, and the fact that the police admit that Melbourne, "has a problem with African gang crime". As a consequence, the author of the post argues that this event illustrates that black people are "sub-human", and the event in Melbourne shows that "the two races (black and white) are incompatible (...). Otherwise they [black people] are so stupid, retarded; they don't connect a belated punishment to their crime".

From this case study, we can see that disability-related hate words are clearly linked to the category of race, and are used to belittle people of another ethnic origin.









For **Malta**, the most used hateful word relating to gender found by the Crawler, on the basis of the list of words selected by the researchers, was 'whore'. The case reported below is derogatory towards both black people and women, as the author of the post considers that women who have relationships with black people are all 'whores'.

This statement made by the author takes place in the context of protests in St Louis (Missouri) on September 2017, after a judge delivered a not guilty verdict in a case relating to a police officer, who was involved in the shooting of a black man. The author uses this event to argue that black people have to be "booted out", of the USA, to Africa, otherwise "blacks will destroy any White Civilisation, if given the same rights as Whites". In order to defend his theory, the author criticizes and incriminates women who have relationships with black people because according to him, that dilutes and weakens the White Civilisation. Consequently, these women are just "white whores, who opened their thighs to these sub-humans". In this case, we see hate words related to gender again used in the context of racism.

Watch videos of these trousered apes protesting the shooting of a drug trafficker, who almost ran over 2 police officers. Blacks will destroy any White Civilisation, if given the same rights as Whites. Before 1965 when segregation was the rule, there were no riots, no whole-scale murders and rapes and Black on White violence. The Jews, those Rodents in Human Form, opened the cage by passing Laws giving Blacks Equality.

Laws that were meant for a High Quality Race, the Whites, became applicable to Black brutes, And chaos ensued - just as the JEWS wanted.

In our world All Blacks will be booted out to Africa, north of the Zambezi. With them will go those White whores, who opened their thighs to these sub-humans. And with them will go their offspring, those innocent mixed breeds.

We of Imperium Europa will clean up all White Lands - throughout the planetary Imperium. Getting rid of the rag-heads will be much easier, for We will reach a Political understanding with their Mullahs and Mahdis and Madras. They will recall All Muslims under penalty of a fatwah - and the Muslims will obey.

In exchange, We will dump that pest hole in the Middle East - leave it to it's fate. And the Rodents will swim out of the sinking ship, before you can say: circumcision. We will guarantine the Rodents on Madagascar - and the parasites, lacking a host, will tear each other to shreds.

**NEXT CASE** 







Slovenia RACE

The example reported is related to the word 'cigan', where the screenshot only shows an extract from a long post.

The article was found on the website of a group that defines its members as Slovenian patriots. The site is full of historical debates which discuss the Venetic theory of ancient Slovenian origins, symbols, myths, heraldry, and similar. It is very nationalistic but the administrators and contributors generally refrain from hate speech and racist discourse. It is the overall context where people associate this group with the making of public appearances and what they stand for, which is nationalism, racism and hate speech, which can be recognized by elements of discrimination and ethnic distance. The Crawler detected the use of the world "cigan" (i.e. Gypsy), which is a derogatory designation for the Roma, based on the preliminary indications provided by the researchers to the tool. However, we can state how this term is still used widely and often claimed not to be derogatory, but simply "how they refer to themselves as well".

It is interesting to note how in this case, which unfortunately represents an increasing trend, the border between what is considered hate speech and what is not can be very thin. The so called 'haters' are becoming more and more aware of which terms and languages are generally accepted on the web, for instance, and what instead can be subject to 'censorship'. This puts us in front of a worrying scenario, where the use of discriminatory words can be justified as it becomes part of a narrative widely accepted and not considered as such.

#### 1. UVOD Nazaj na vrh

Uvodoma moramo pojasniti zakaj dosledno uporabljamo že stoletja staro slovensko poimenovanje Cigan za pripadnike ljudstva, ki so ga naši predniki in tudi mi vsi, (do nedavnega) imenovali Cigani. V knjigi Ilustrirana zgodovina Slovencev, je navedeno, da so Cigani na Slovenskem prvič omenjeni v 15. stoletju. Ob tem moramo posebej poudatiti, da takrat ni Slo za trajno naselitev Ciganov, temveč za njihovo prvo omembo. O avtohtonosti Ciganov zato nikakor ne moremo govoriti, saj je njihova temeljna značilnost spreminjanje bivališča, (nomadstvo) ne pa trajna naselitev. V 15. stoletju, natančneje 1408, so Turki prvič vdrli na današnje slovensko ozemlje v okolici Metlike. Pojav Ciganov dejansko časovno sovpada s turškimi vpadi v slovenske dežele.

Tudi v slovenski ljudski pesmi in literaturi se Cigani zelo pogosto pojavljajo v povezavi s Turki, ob čemer je vloga Ciganov večinoma negativna. Nedopustno bi bilo obsojati številne slovenske pisatelje, pesnike in glasbenike, da so v svojih delih uporabili pojem Cigan na negativen način zato, ker so bili nestrpni, do Ciganov (Rado Murnik - Lepi janičar, Josip Jurčič, Oton Župančič, Oto Pestner, Vlado Kreslin...).

V enem izmed leksikonov (Leksikon Cankarjeve založbe iz leta 1973) je pod pojmom Cigan zapisano:« Gre za ljudstvo, ki živi v majhnih potujočih skupinah skoraj po vsem evroazijskem kontinentu, razen v vzhodni in jugovzhodni Aziji«. Po statističnih podatkih, bi naj bilo Ciganov v Evropi leta 1971 okrog 1 milijon, medtem ko jih je po njihovih navedbah, v sedanji EU nekaj čez 10 milijonov! V 35. letih se je torej njihovo število povečalo za več kot 10 x (1), kar pomeni, da imajo v povprečju celo precej večjo nataliteto kot Kitajci v enakem časovnem obdobju!

Slovar slovenskega knjižnega jezika (SSKJ) pozna kar nekaj besed s korenom -cigan-, kar nakazuje na izraze starejšega izvora, ki so se razvili na podlagi značilnosti, ki so jih pripisovali Ciganom. Teh besed se danes, v stilu puristov, nekateri zavestno otepajo, češ da so nestrpne in imajo negativen pomen. Na tem mestu je dopustno napraviti sklep, da zgodovinsko negativna konotacija bržkone ni nastala zaradi kontinuitete dobrih, sprejemljivih ravnanj, temveč prav nasprotno, zaradi moralno spornih, nesprejemljivih i škodijivih ravnanj. Še več – v zvezi s tem korenom se je razvila kopica rekov in besednih zvez: *ssmejati se kot cigan belemu kruhu\*, \*cigan poje ovitek od čokolade, ki je srebrn, čokolado pa vrže stran\*, \*biti črn kot cigan\*, \*lagati kot cigan\* ...* 





### Slovenia

XENOPHOBIA , ANTI-MIGRANTS

This case concerns the Twitter platform, and in particular the case of a journalist who created a huge public debate when, in August 2015, he tweeted the following statement: Europe can easily solve immigrant crisis. With bullets.

No legal action was taken against him, and he continued to enjoy the sympathy of intolerant right-wing proponents of closed borders and bans on immigration. Yet it ignited the public, who thought his words were directly inciting hatred and that he should thus be prosecuted for using hate speech. It is not surprising that his Twitter account has been reported as containing hate speech again within this eMORE exercise.

**NEXT CASE** 







The analysis of the Crawler results presented some challenges also for Cyprus. However, three key words stand out as most gathered in terms of data - Maiµou,  $\Delta ou\lambda a$ , Toupkog – monkey, servant/slave, Turk. In attempting to export the research, the excel file appears to be corrupted: nonetheless, some links worked and direct the enquirer to the website of a fascist organization based in Limassol, Cyprus (KEA - Kivnµa E $\lambda\lambda$ ηνικής Αντίστασης). While the analysts were not able to use the data exported to understand actual events in real-time, as the data did not correspond to specific articles or comments, they could still verify that the website of this organization is an active blog run by the extreme right. It resembles a portal, as it features articles on a wide variety of issues from fascist perspectives such as the Cypriot problem, Greek History, Ideology, derogative categories on political parties, the mainstream media, Turkey and legal issues. Its worth mentioning that the website regularly features the speech of Golden Dawn MPs in the Greek media and parliament.

Οι τουρκομόγγολοι εισβάλλουν στη Συρία για να προστατεύσουν τον τάφο του γενάρχη τους. Οι εδώ γραικύλοι ενσυνειδήτως σας κοροιδεύουν ότι οι τουρκομόγγολοι θα σεβαστούν τις συμφωνίες περί ΔΔΟ



Οι τουρκομόγγολοι εισβάλλουν στη Συρία για να προστατεύσουν τον τάφο του γενάρχη τους, εκτάσεως 50 τετραγωνικών μέτρων, που βρίσκεται σε βάθος 30 χιλιόμετρα από τα τουρκοσυριακά σύνορα. Σ΄αυτούς τους τουρκομόγγολους βασίζονται οι εδώ γραικύλοι ότι θα σεβαστούν τις συμφωνίες περί ΔΔΟ και κολοκύθια. Διαβάστε την είδηση.

#### Παναγιώτης Κλεοβούλου

Τουρκική στρατιωτική εισβολή βρίσκεται σε εξέλιξη αυτή την στιγμή στην Συρία, με αφορμή την προστασία του Τουρκομογγόλου οθωμανοφ φύλλαρχου Süleyman ξαιh που θεωρείται πατριάρχης της τουρκικής "φυλής" και βρίσκεται σε απόσταση 30 χιλιομέτρων από τα τουρκοσυμακά σύνορα. One example of an article from the website, which refers to "Turkmogols" (a derogative term combining both negative connotative words in Cypriot slang of "Turk" and "Mogol", denoting those who came from afar as barbarians and thus not entitled to live around Greeks), is signed by the leader of the organisation and is followed by a comment on the war in Syria. The comment uses derogative words to find the similarities between the Turkish invasion of Syria and the invasion of Cyprus in 1974. Moreover, the title refers to Turkey as not trustworthy regarding peace in the light of the talks between the leaders from the Bizonal Bicommunal Federation, which is the suggested solution for re-uniting Cyprus. As a cover photo, the article features hard-core content; Solomos Solomou, a Greek/Cypriot nationalist lies on the floor where he was killed by a Turkish/Cypriot official during his attempt to remove the Turkish flag at a demonstration in a UN buffer zone in 1996. This is an example where the national question is used to stir nationalist fervour, racism and religion related hate speech.







RESSC SEARCH CENTRE ON SECURITY AND CRIM



This post on You tube comments on a video dedicated to parents acceptance of their LGBT sons and daughters. The author of the post apparently affirms that parents must respect and love their children no matter what their passions or weaknesses are, but at the same time he/she states that the parents must not promote or legalize 'abnormal sexual preferences'. While this person is not clearly or directly offending the people in the video or the LGBT community as such, he/she is still making reference to 'sexual preferences' as well as to 'abnormality'; thus the comment represents a form of offense and dissemination of hateful sentiments against LGBT people.



#### Andreas Petrou 1 week ago (edited)

Διαφωνώ, η σωστή αντιμετώπιση θα ήταν σέβομαι τα παιδιά μου και τους αγαπώ ως ανθρώπους με πάθη και αδυναμίες και προσπαθώ να τους βοηθήσω αλλά όχι την επικράτειά και νομιμοποίηση των παρα φυσιν η σεξουαλικών δήθεν πλέον ονομαζομενων προτιμήσεων. Τεράστια ή διαφορα.

IN A REPLY







One controversial case presented in the Italian national report concerns the reactions to a comment posted by a cultural mediator of Pakistani origin, following the news of an episode of sexual violence that took place in the city of Rimini.

The news, regarding aggression towards a couple of tourists and violence of a sexual nature against the woman, both originally from Poland, was perpetrated by a group of people of North-African origin, and raised a huge discussion in the country with regards to topics such as security and migration. A few days after this terrible crime, a 24 year old cultural mediator of Pakistani origin posted a shocking comment online, saying that sexual violence against women is seen as bad only at the beginning of the act, and then it becomes 'normal', as showed in the screenshot below.

The comment was forwarded to national newspapers and became a political case throughout Italy. A number of hateful comments addressing the cultural mediator followed, who was first suspended and then fired by the CSO.

The tone of the comments was the following:

"Keep him in jail until he rots. Like a good Muslim he is false, hypocritical, a liar, arrogant, violent, an unbeliever, cowardly, etc. etc. (...) Do you want to understand that the cooperatives that welcome them with open arms are accomplices to these criminals ?????"

"Let's send this leech parasite back to Pakistan! Kicks in the ass and go!"

"If he does not understand Italian, he should be back to his home. This TROGLODYTE!"

Hate speech, in this case, directly connects the content of the mediator's comment to his origin and religion. According to the authors of the comments, his ideas are related to the fact that he is a Muslim/Pakistani and all Muslims/Pakistani necessarily think in the same way - they are a community of like-minded people.

Hate speech refers also to the company that hired the mediator, a cooperative working with refugees and asylum seekers.



#### Abid Jee

Lo stupro è un atto peggio ma solo all'inizio, poi la do come un rapporto sessuale normale.

**NEXT CASE** 

SS





Italy HATE AGAINST WOMEN

One of the few cases collected for **Italy** through the eMORE app concerns hate towards women. After having shared on Facebook the news related to a young girl originally from Poland, who has been the victim of sexual violence by a group of people of North African origin, the municipal secretary Saverio Siorini, belonging to the movement named "Noi con Salvini" - which supports the leader of the political party Lega Nord, and who was recently made Ministry of the Interior - attacked the President of the Chamber (at that time) Laura Boldrini, as well as all the female members of the Democratic Party: "But to Boldrini and the women of the Democratic Party, when will it happen? (to be raped)". As a consequence of this post, Siorini was expelled from his party.

**NEXT CASE** 

SSC







**Romania** HATE AGAINST WOMEN

#### **IN FOCUS**

#### Hate against Roma: examples of narratives used in the media in Romania

Due to a number of challenges encountered by the Romanian partner in using the crawler for the qualitative analysis, the researchers decided to carry out an in-focus by analysing a selection of media news and articles from 2017, mainly focused on Roma and their leaders, identified using the words 'Roma' or 'Gypsies'.

Although the word Gypsy is considered as racist in Romania, still some TV stations use it in their news reports. This is usually not a neutral choice, or based on ignorance about the use of this word, as there have been intense national debates about the correct terms to use. Those who oppose using the word Roma – the way Roma actually call themselves in their own language – mainly do it with a racist undertone, as they do not want Roma to be confused with Romanian<sup>2</sup>.

While there are notable differences between the journalistic approaches of the different TV stations included in the analysis, with some using a more neutral reporting than others, articles are full of generalizations, often already from the title. Furthermore, the majority send, directly or indirectly, a negative message about the Roma, generally linked to some societal prejudiced belief. One of the hypothesis is that the media tend to use the embedded societal racism against the Roma to get further readership/rating.

The general Roma portrait that comes out, either directly suggested or implied, by analysing only the titles (and being the researchers mindful of the Romanian context), is that Roma would be: backward, uncivilized, ridiculous in a naïve, child-like fashion, constantly in search for easy-made money, devious, squatters who live off the backs of others/the state, irrational and simple-minded, violent and aggressive - sometimes cruel, thieves/criminals of some sort. They would tarnish the image of Romania abroad, through their behaviour and the bad things they say about the country, or simply because others associate 'us' with 'them'. Some stories report on compensation paid to Roma, and in some instances the titles suggest it would be unwarranted, pointing to the prejudice that respecting Roma rights is a "political correctness" sort of thing, imposed from abroad.

It is interesting to note how the argument of politically correctness is often used by haters when commenting on antiracism narrative or politics.

<sup>2</sup> Red Network, Roma versus Gypsy - a typically Romanian dilemma, available at: http://www.red-network.eu/?i=red-network.en.items&id=722



